

The HS2 Debate

National Curriculum Objectives:

English Year 5 & Year 6: [Drawing inferences such as inferring characters' feelings, thoughts and motives from their actions, and justifying inferences with evidence](#)

Geography KS2: [Describe and understand key aspects of human geography, including: types of settlement and land use, economic activity including trade links, and the distribution of natural resources including energy, food, minerals and water](#)

Differentiation for Challenge Activity:

Section A Tick the correct word to fill in the information from the text.

Section B Use the information in the text to decide whether the statements are 'for' or 'against' the development of HS2.

Section C Decide whether the statements are true or false

Section D Complete the chart with information from the text

More [Human Geography](#) Resources.

Did you like this resource? Don't forget to review it [here](#).

The HS2 Question

High-speed rail first appeared in the UK in 2003, with the High Speed 1 link connecting London to the Channel Tunnel and therefore Europe.

E: (Q1) When did the first high-speed rail link appear in the UK? (C6/2b) 2003.

The UK government set up High Speed 2 Ltd, which considered whether a second high-speed rail line would improve travel in the UK, so the HS2 debate began. In 2009, the High Speed 2 (HS2) was launched: a high-speed rail link connecting London to the Midlands and eventually beyond to Manchester and Leeds.

E: (Q2) In what year was the HS2 project launched? (C6/2b) 2009.

D: (Q7) Where is the HS2 rail link planned to start and end? (C6/2b) It starts in London and will go to Birmingham and eventually Manchester and Leeds.

Supporters of the HS2 say it will herald a new era, making travel between the Midlands and London much quicker and easier than ever before.

S: (Q13) What do you think the writer means by the phrase 'herald a new era'? (C7) It will bring on a huge change to rail travel in our country.

However, for the project to become successful, the proposed route will cut through many natural areas and even people's residences.

S: (Q14) What does the word 'proposed' suggest about the route of the HS2? (C7) It is not yet finalised and may be subject to change in the future.

E: (Q3) What does the phrase 'people's residences' mean in the context of this text? (C1/2a) People's homes and gardens.

Whether you think the disruption is worth the benefits the project will bring or not, the debate will continue to rage on. Which side of the argument represents your point of view?

For

- When completed, the HS2 will be approximately 330 miles long and will connect the North and South of the country together.
- More than half of the 140-mile route between London and Birmingham will be in cuttings or tunnels, so will therefore have low visual impact on the surrounding areas.

D: (Q8) Why does the 'For' section suggest the train will have a low visual impact at first? (C6/2b) Most of the train line will be built in cuttings and tunnels and so will not be seen.

- The HS2 trains will run up to 400km per hour, which is faster than other European high-speed trains. People will be able to travel from place to place much faster, allowing for easier commuting.
- 2 million trees will be planted along the proposed route between London and the West Midlands to counteract any damage to the natural environment.

S: (Q15) Do you think planting 2 million trees is a good enough to counteract the damaged caused to the natural environment? Explain your answer. (R2) Personal response. Answers could refer to the 'Costs' section of the text.

- It is estimated that 4.5 million air trips and 9 million road trips a year will become redundant due to the rail link, which will help the UK government to cut carbon emissions.

S: (Q16) Why do you think the rail link will make some air and road trips unnecessary? (P5/2d)

Due to the speed of the new train, people will choose to travel using the train rather than travelling by air and road.

- The HS2 will reduce the strain on our already over-congested roads, allowing for less stressful travel.

D: (Q9) What does the 'For' section suggest will allow for 'less stressful travel'? (C6/2b) The construction of the HS2 would ease the already over-congested roads.

- The rail link is expected to create benefits of £59 billion, having a great impact on the economy of the entire country.
- The whole country will benefit from HS2, with 100,000 jobs predicted to be created through its construction. The line will boost the economy in the North particularly, as well as the economy of the UK as a whole.

E: (Q4) How many jobs are predicted to be created by the construction of the HS2? (C6/2b) 100,000.

- £36.2 billion of investment will go into the project between 2017 and 2033, which is roughly about £2 billion per year.
- Due to better travel links, businesses may be encouraged to start up in areas that previously were neglected.

E: (Q5) Which of the benefits discussed do you find the most convincing? (R2) Personal response.

M: (Q20) Who do you think will be the main group to benefit from the construction of the HS2? (R2) Personal response. Answers must refer to the text.

Against

- Around 14 different Grade II listed buildings will be affected by the route between London and Birmingham, destroying many important historical sites.
- A £500 million tunnel will need to be built through an area of the Chiltern Hills in the south east of England. This has been designated as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB).

D: (Q10) How will the Chiltern Hills be affected by the construction of the HS2? (C6/2b) A large tunnel will be built through this area which will destroy the beauty of the landscape.

- Many natural environments and animal habitats across the country will be completely destroyed.
- A 400km per hour train will use three times the amount of power and energy that regular 200km per hour trains use.
- The amount of concrete needed to complete the full network would cover an area equivalent to the size of Manchester.
- It is thought that 27% of the projected passengers will only travel at all because HS2 is built, therefore increasing carbon levels through unnecessary journeys.
- Three times as many passenger journeys will be towards London, meaning that the distribution of possible benefits will go primarily to that area and nowhere else.

- Estimated costs keep continuing to rise and rise. Some say that the costs are spiralling out of control.

S: (Q17) What does the phrase 'spiralling' suggest about the cost of the HS2? (C7) It is getting higher and higher at a very quick rate; it cannot be controlled.

- Many believe the money it will cost to build the HS2 would be better spent elsewhere, on areas such as education or the NHS.

E: (Q6) Do you agree that the money would be better spent on education or the NHS? Explain your answer. (R2) Personal response.

- Ticket prices are expected to be too expensive for the average rail user to afford, therefore only wealthy people of business will use it.
- The cost to the British taxpayer will be around £1000 per household, many of whom will not benefit at all from the creation of the rail link.

M: (Q21) How does the costs to British taxpayers make you feel? Explain your answer. (R2) Personal response. Answers must refer to the text.

- All the negative impacts listed above, will only allow people to get from London to Birmingham 20 minutes faster, something which could be solved by simply catching an earlier train.

M: (Q22) Why do you think the final point about saving travellers 20 minutes was left until last in the 'Against' section? (L5/2g) It has the greatest impact as it is the strongest point. It suggests that after all the costs there is very little gain.

It is clear to see both the potential costs and benefits of a project such as this one. Many people feel extremely passionate about the project one way or another, with affected residents even starting campaign groups to protest the construction of the train line. In these places, posters and placards can be seen objecting to the HS2.

D: (Q11) How are affected residents showing their feelings about the HS2? (C6/2b) They are protesting by putting up signs and placards.

But despite all the controversy and disagreements, it appears that the HS2 will plough on regardless.

S: (Q18) What does the word 'controversy' suggest about the HS2 debate? (C7) Many people differ in opinion about it and it has caused a lot of disagreement and trouble.

M: (Q23) What do you predict will happen when the construction work first begins? (P2/2e) Personal response.

M: (Q24) What sort of text would you suggest this is? (T2) Answers could suggest either a debate or balanced argument.

M: (Q25) Do you think the text is mainly fact or opinion? What impact does this have on the text? (C9) It is mainly fact. This allows the reader to make up their own mind as it doesn't try to persuade them with opinions.

S: (Q19) Which side do you think an environmentalist would relate to? Justify your answer using evidence from the text. (R2) Against, due to the negative impact on the natural environment and animal habitats.

D: (Q12) Which side of the argument do you think is the strongest? Explain your answer. (R2) Personal response.

M: (Q26) Can you think of possible questions to pose to people both 'for' and 'against' the HS2's construction? (P4) Personal response.

classroomsecrets.com

The HS2 Debate – Year 6 – Teacher Version

The HS2 Debate

High-speed rail first appeared in the UK in 2003, with the High Speed 1 link connecting London to the Channel Tunnel and therefore Europe. The UK government set up High Speed 2 Ltd, which considered whether a second high-speed rail line would improve travel in the UK, so the HS2 debate began. In 2009, the High Speed 2 (HS2) was launched: a high-speed rail link connecting London to the Midlands and eventually beyond to Manchester and Leeds.

Supporters of the HS2 say it will herald a new era, making travel between the Midlands and London much quicker and easier than ever before. However, for the project to become successful, the proposed route will cut through many natural areas and even people's residences. Whether you think the disruption is worth the benefits the project will bring or not, the debate will continue to rage on. Which side of the argument represents your point of view?

For

- When completed, the HS2 will be approximately 330 miles long and will connect the North and South of the country together.
- More than half of the 140-mile route between London and Birmingham will be in cuttings or tunnels, so will therefore have low visual impact on the surrounding areas.
- The HS2 trains will run up to 400km per hour, which is faster than other European high-speed trains. People will be able to travel from place to place much faster, allowing for easier commuting.
- 2 million trees will be planted along the proposed route between London and the West Midlands to counteract any damage to the natural environment.
- It is estimated that 4.5 million air trips and 9 million road trips a year will become redundant due to the rail link, which will help the UK government to cut carbon emissions.
- The HS2 will reduce the strain on our already over-congested roads, allowing for less stressful travel.
- The rail link is expected to create benefits of £59 billion, having a great impact on the economy of the entire country.
- The whole country will benefit from HS2, with 100,000 jobs predicted to be created through its construction. The line will boost the economy in the North particularly, as well as the economy of the UK as a whole.
- £36.2 billion of investment will go into the project between 2017 and 2033, which is roughly about £2 billion per year.
- Due to better travel links, businesses may be encouraged to start up in areas that previously were neglected.

Against

- Around 14 different Grade II listed buildings will be affected by the route between London and Birmingham, destroying many important historical sites.
- A £500 million tunnel will need to be built through an area of the Chiltern Hills in the south east of England. This has been designated as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB).
- Many natural environments and animal habitats across the country will be completely destroyed.
- A 400km per hour train will use three times the amount of power and energy that regular 200km per hour trains use.
- The amount of concrete needed to complete the full network would cover an area equivalent to the size of Manchester.
- It is thought that 27% of the projected passengers will only travel at all because HS2 is built, therefore increasing carbon levels through unnecessary journeys.
- Three times as many passenger journeys will be towards London, meaning that the distribution of possible benefits will go primarily to that area and nowhere else.
- Estimated costs keep continuing to rise and rise. Some say that the costs are spiralling out of control.
- Many believe the money it will cost to build the HS2 would be better spent elsewhere, on areas such as education or the NHS.
- Ticket prices are expected to be too expensive for the average rail user to afford, therefore only wealthy people of business will use it.
- The cost to the British taxpayer will be around £1000 per household, many of whom will not benefit at all from the creation of the rail link.
- All the negative impacts listed above, will only allow people to get from London to Birmingham 20 minutes faster, something which could be solved by simply catching an earlier train.

It is clear to see both the potential costs and benefits of a project such as this one. Many people feel extremely passionate about the project one way or another, with affected residents even starting campaign groups to protest the construction of the train line. In these places, posters and placards can be seen objecting to the HS2. But despite all the controversy and disagreements, it appears that the HS2 will plough on regardless.

The HS2 Question – Comprehension

Section A

1. When did the first high-speed rail link appear in the UK? (C6/2b)

2. In what year was the HS2 project launched? (C6/2b)

3. What does the phrase ‘people’s residences’ mean in the context of this text? (C1/2a)

4. How many jobs are predicted to be created by the construction of the HS2? (C6/2b)

5. Which of the benefits discussed do you find the most convincing? (R2)

6. Do you agree that the money would be better spent on education or the NHS?
Explain your answer. (R2)

Section B

7. Where is the HS2 rail link planned to start and end? (C6/2b)

8. Why does the 'For' section suggest the train will have a low visual impact at first? (C6/2b)

9. What does the 'For' section suggest will allow for 'less stressful travel'? (C6/2b)

10. How will the Chiltern Hills be affected by the construction of the HS2? (C6/2b)

11. How are affected residents showing their feelings about the HS2? (C6/2b)

12. Which side of the argument do you think is the strongest? Explain your answer. (R2)

Section C

13. What do you think the writer means by the phrase ‘herald a new era’? (C7)

14. What does the word ‘proposed’ suggest about the route of the HS2? (C7)

15. Do you think planting 2 million trees is a good enough to counteract the damaged caused to the natural environment? Explain your answer. (R2)

16. Why do you think the rail link will make some air and road trips unnecessary? (P5/2d)

17. What does the phrase ‘spiralling’ suggest about the cost of the HS2? (C7)

18. What does the word ‘controversy’ suggest about the HS2 debate? (C7)

19. Which side do you think an environmentalist would relate to? Justify your answer using evidence from the text. (R2)

Section D

20. Who do you think will be the main group to benefit from the construction of the HS2? (R2)

21. How does the costs to British taxpayers make you feel? Explain your answer. (R2)

22. Why do you think the final point about saving travellers 20 minutes was left until last in the ‘Against’ section? (L5/2g)

23. What do you predict will happen when the construction work first begins? (P2/2e)

24. What sort of text would you suggest this is? (T2)

25. Do you think the text is mainly fact or opinion? What impact does this have on the text? (C9)

26. Can you think of possible questions to pose to people both ‘for’ and ‘against’ the HS2’s construction? (P4)

The HS2 Question – Challenge Activity

Section A

Tick the correct answer.

High Speed 2 (HS2) was launched in...

2090

☐

2009

☐

2900

☐

2019

☐

The aim of HS2 is to speed up travel between the Midlands and...

Cardiff

☐

Edinburgh

☐

Belfast

☐

London

☐

The HS2 train will run up to...

200kmph

☐

400mph

☐

400kmph

☐

40kmph

☐

The Chiltern Hills have been designated as an...

AONB

☐

ANOB

☐

AOBN

☐

ABON

☐

HS2 will make the journey from London to Birmingham quicker by...

12 minutes

☐

20 minutes

☐

200 minutes

☐

2 hours

☐

Section B

Use the information in the text to decide whether these statements are 'for' or 'against' the development of HS2.

	For	Against
A 400km per hour train will use three times the amount of power and energy that regular 200km per hour trains use.		
When completed, the HS2 will be approximately 330 miles long and will connect the North and South of the country.		
Estimated costs keep continuing to rise and rise. Some say that the costs are spiralling out of control.		
The HS2 will reduce the strain on our already over-congested roads allowing for less stressful travel.		
Due to better travel links, businesses may be encouraged to start up in areas that previously were neglected.		
Ticket prices are expected to be too expensive for the average rail user to afford.		

The HS2 Question – Challenge Activity

Section C

Use the information in the text to decide whether these statements are true or false.

	True	False
20 million trees will be planted along the proposed route between London and the West Midlands.		
£36.6 billion of investment will go into the project between 2017 and 2033, which is roughly about £2 billion per year.		
Around 14 different Grade II listed buildings will be affected by the route between London and Birmingham.		
The amount of concrete needed to complete the full network would cover an area equivalent to the size of Manchester.		
Many natural environments and animal habitats across the country will be completely destroyed.		
The cost to the British taxpayer will be around £10,000 per household.		

Section D

Complete this chart using information from the text.

Places that will be linked by HS2	
Length when completed	
Top speed	
Investment per year	
Timescale of project	
Cost to taxpayer	

The HS2 Question – Challenge Activity

Section A

Tick the correct answer.

High Speed 2 (HS2) was launched in...

2090

☐

2009

☒

2900

☐

2019

☐

The aim of HS2 is to speed up travel between the Midlands and...

Cardiff

☐

Edinburgh

☐

Belfast

☐

London

☒

The HS2 train will run up to...

200kmph

☐

400mph

☐

400kmph

☒

40kmph

☐

The Chiltern Hills have been designated as an...

AONB

☒

ANOB

☐

AOBN

☐

ABON

☐

HS2 will make the journey from London to Birmingham quicker by...

12 minutes

☐

20 minutes

☒

200 minutes

☐

2 hours

☐

Section B

Use the information in the text to decide whether these statements are 'for' or 'against' the development of HS2.

	For	Against
A 400km per hour train will use three times the amount of power and energy that regular 200km per hour trains use.		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
When completed, the HS2 will be approximately 330 miles long and will connect the North and South of the country.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Estimated costs keep continuing to rise and rise. Some say that the costs are spiralling out of control.		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
The HS2 will reduce the strain on our already over-congested roads allowing for less stressful travel.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Due to better travel links, businesses may be encouraged to start up in areas that previously were neglected.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Ticket prices are expected to be too expensive for the average rail user to afford.		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

The HS2 Question – Challenge Activity

Section C

Use the information in the text to decide whether these statements are true or false.

	True	False
20 million trees will be planted along the proposed route between London and the West Midlands.		✓
£36.6 billion of investment will go into the project between 2017 and 2033, which is roughly about £2 billion per year.		✓
Around 14 different Grade II listed buildings will be affected by the route between London and Birmingham.	✓	
The amount of concrete needed to complete the full network would cover an area equivalent to the size of Manchester.	✓	
Many natural environments and animal habitats across the country will be completely destroyed.	✓	
The cost to the British taxpayer will be around £10,000 per household.		✓

Section D

Complete this chart using information from the text.

Places that will be linked by HS2	London, Midlands, Manchester and Leeds
Length when completed	330 miles long
Top speed	400kmph
Investment per year	£2 billion
Timescale of project	2017 to 2033
Cost to taxpayer	£1000 per household

Whole Class Guided Reading – Teaching Guide

- The text is for the children to read. Give each pair a copy of the text (without questions) to read individually or as a whole class. This text has been aimed at Year 6 Secure.
- The teacher should use the teacher version. It shows you where to pause after each section and provides questions for you to ask. The colours refer to our levels so that you can direct specific questions at specific students (their version does not have these colours or show them which is mastery, etc.).
 - Beginner – Year 6 Emerging (Red)
 - Easy – Year 6 Developing (Blue)
 - Tricky – Year 6 Secure (Orange)
 - Expert – Year 6 Mastery (Green)
- The children can record their answers to the questions at the end of the shared read/discussion or in a different session by using the comprehension sheet. The questions have been re-grouped into abilities so that you can assign sections to specific children.
 - Section A – Year 6 Emerging
 - Section B – Year 6 Developing
 - Section C – Year 6 Secure
 - Section D – Year 6 Mastery
- The codes at the end of each question refer to the interim statements and the reading objectives from the New National Curriculum for England (a guide to the codes can be found at the end of this document).

Comprehension

Year 1/2	C1/1a	Discussing word meanings, linking new meanings to known vocabulary
	C2	Answer simple, information retrieval questions about texts*
	C3	Drawing on what they already know from background information and vocabulary provided by the teacher
	C4	Discussing and expressing views about a wide range of texts
	C5/1c	Discussing the sequence of events in texts and how items of information are related
Year 3/4	C1/2a	Explaining the meaning of words in context
	C4	Discussing and expressing views about a wide range of texts
	C6/2b	Retrieve and record information from fiction and non-fiction
	C7	Identifying how language, structure and presentation contribute to meaning
Year 5/6	C1/2a	Exploring the meaning of words in context
	C4	Discussing and expressing views about a wide range of texts
	C6/2b	Retrieve, record and present information from fiction and non-fiction
	C7	Identifying how language, structure and presentation contribute to meaning
	C8/2h	Making comparisons within and across texts
	C9	Distinguish between statements of fact and opinion

Predictions and Making Inferences

Year 1/2	P1	Link the text to their own experiences
	P2/1e	Predicting what might happen on the basis of what has been read so far
	P3/1d	Making inferences on the basis of what is being said and done
	P4	Answering and asking questions
Year 3/4	P2/2e	Predicting what might happen from details stated and implied
	P4	Asking questions to improve their understanding
	P5/2d	Drawing inferences such as inferring characters' feelings, thoughts and motives from their actions, and justifying inferences with evidence
Year 5/6	P2/2e	Predicting what might happen from details stated and implied
	P4	Asking questions to improve their understanding
	P5/2d	Drawing inferences such as inferring characters' feelings, thoughts and motives from their actions, and justifying inferences with evidence

Language for Effect

Year 1/2	L1	Recognising and joining in with predictable phrases
	L2	Learning to appreciate rhymes and poems, and to recite some by heart with appropriate intonation to make the meaning clear
Year 3/4	L3	Using dictionaries to check the meaning of words they have read
	L4	Preparing poems and play scripts to read aloud and to perform, showing understanding through intonation, tone, volume and action
Year 5/6	L2	Learning a wider range of poetry by heart
	L4	Preparing poems and play scripts to read aloud and to perform, showing understanding through intonation, tone, volume and action so that the meaning is clear to an audience
	L5/2g	Discuss and evaluate the authors' use of language, including figurative language, including the impact on the reader and how meaning is enhanced through the author's choice of words and phrases
	L6/2f	Identify and explain how content is related and contributes to meaning as a whole
		*not currently a curriculum objective

Summarising

Year 1/2	S1	Discussing the significance of the title and events
Year 3/4	S2/2c	Identifying main ideas drawn from more than one paragraph and summarising these
Year 5/6	S2/2c	Summarising from more than one paragraph, identifying key details which support the main ideas

Themes and Conventions

Year 1/2	T1/1b	Becoming very familiar with non-fiction and fiction, such as key stories, fairy stories and traditional tales, and retelling them
	T2/1b	Considering the particular characteristics of the above texts
Year 3/4	T3	Reading texts that are structured in different ways and reading for a range of purposes
	T4	Identifying themes and conventions in a wide range of texts
	T5	Recognising some different forms of poetry
Year 5/6	T2	Increasing their familiarity with a wide range of books, including myths, legends and traditional stories, modern fiction, fiction from our literary heritage, and texts from other cultures and traditions
	T4	Identifying and discussing themes and conventions in and across a wide range of writing

Reading for Pleasure

Year 1/2	R1	Listening to and discussing a wide range of fiction and non-fiction texts
	R2	Participate in discussion about texts, poems and other works that are read to them and those that they can read for themselves, taking turns and listening to what others say
	R3	Discussing their favourite words and phrases
Year 3/4	R1	Listening to and discussing a wide range of fiction and non-fiction texts
	R2	Participate in discussion about both texts that are read to them and those they can read for themselves, taking turns and listening to what others say
	R3	Discussing words and phrases that capture the reader's interest and imagination
Year 5/6	R2	Participate in discussions about books that are read to them and those they can read for themselves, building on their own and others' ideas and challenging views courteously
	R3	Discussing words and phrases that capture the reader's interest and imagination
	R4	Recommending texts that they have read to their peers, giving reasons for their choices